Nonlinear Dynamics and Systems Theory, 16 (3) (2016) 312-321



Co-existence of Various Types of Synchronization Between Hyper-chaotic Maps

Adel Ouannas*

Department of Mathematics and Computer Science, Constantine University, Algeria; Laboratory of Mathematics, Informatics and Systems (LAMIS), University of Larbi Tebessi, Tebessa, 12002 Algeria.

Received: January 13, 2015; Revised: December 15, 2015

Abstract: In this paper, we propose a new type of hybrid synchronization combining projective synchronization (PS), full state hybrid projective synchronization (FSHPS) and generalized synchronization (GS). We present, based on nonlinear controllers, a new control scheme to study the co-existence of (PS), (FSHPS) and (GS) between general 3D hyperchaotic maps. The capability of the proposed approach is illustrated by numerical example.

Keywords: hyperchaotic maps; synchronization; co-existence; Lyapunov stability.

Mathematics Subject Classification (2010): 93C10, 93C55, 93D05.

1 Introduction

Historically, hyperchaos in discrete-time systems was firstly reported by Rössler [1]. A hyperchaotic system is usually defined as a chaotic system with more than one positive Lyapunov exponent. The occurrence of hyperchaotic behavior has been found in an electronic circuit [2], NMR laser [3], in a semi-conductor system [4] and in a chemical reaction system [5]. Some interesting hyperchaotic systems in discrete-time were presented in the past two decades such as Baier-Klain system [6], Hitzl-Zele map [7], Stefanski map [8], Wang map [9], Rössler discrete-time system [10] and Grassi-Miller map [11] etc. Since hyperchaotic maps are more complex than chaotic maps, their dynamics have been investigated extensively owing to their useful potential applications in

^{*} Corresponding author: mailto:ouannas_adel@yahoo.fr

^{© 2016} InforMath Publishing Group/1562-8353 (print)/1813-7385 (online)/http://e-ndst.kiev.ua312

secure communications [12–17]. Thus it is a more important subject to study hyperchaos synchronization.

Recently, more and more attention has been paid to the synchronization of chaos (hyperchaos) in discrete-time dynamical systems [18–22]. Different synchronization types have been proposed for discrete-time chaotic and hyperchaotic maps such as projective synchronization [23], adaptive function projective synchronization [24, 25], function cascade synchronization [26], generalized synchronization [27, 28], lag synchronization [29], impulsive synchronization [30], hybrid synchronization [31], Q-S synchronization [32] and full state hybrid projective synchronization [33, 34]. Among all synchronization types, projective synchronization (GS) are effective approaches for achieving the synchronization of chaotic and hyperchaotic discrete-time systems. (PS) means that the drive chaotic system and the response chaotic system synchronize up to scaling constant, FSHPS means that each drive system state synchronizes with a linear combination of response system states and (GS) appears when there exists functional relationship between the states of the drive and the response chaotic systems.

In this paper, a new general scheme of synchronization which includes (PS), (FSHPS) and (GS) between coupled 3D hyperchaotic maps is constructed. Based on stability theory of linear discrete-time systems, Lyapunov stability theory and using nonlinear controllers, a new criterion of co-existence of (PS), (FSHPS) and (GS) is derived. The derived synchronization results can have an important effect in the application due to complexity of the proposed scheme and the difficulty of the prediction of the scaling factors. To validate the proposed approach numerically, we apply it to two hyperchaotic maps: the hyperchaotic Wang map and the hyperchaotic Stefanski map.

This paper is organized as follows. In Section 2, the problem of co-existence of synchronization types is introduced. Our approach of synchronization is described in Section 3. In Section 4, numerical example is used to show the effectiveness of the proposed synchronization method. In Section 5, conclusion is made.

2 Problem Statement

We consider the following drive and response chaotic systems

$$x_i(k+1) = f_i(X(k)), \quad 1 \le i \le 3,$$
(1)

$$y_i(k+1) = g_i(Y(k)) + u_i, \quad 1 \le i \le 3,$$
(2)

where $(x_1(k), x_2(k), x_3(k))^T$, $(y_1(k), y_2(k), y_3(k))^T$ are the states of the drive and the response systems, respectively, f_i , $g_i : \mathbf{R}^3 \to \mathbf{R}$, $1 \le i \le 3$, and u_i , $1 \le i \le 3$, are controllers to be determined.

The error system between the drive system (1) and the response system (2) is defined as

$$e_{1}(k) = y_{1}(k) - \theta x_{1}(k), \qquad (3)$$

$$e_{2}(k) = y_{2}(k) - \sum_{j=1}^{3} \lambda_{j} x_{j}(k),$$

$$e_{3}(k) = y_{3}(k) - \phi(x_{1}, x_{2}, x_{3})(k),$$

where $\theta \in \mathbf{R}^*$, $\lambda_j \in \mathbf{R}^*$ j = 1, 2, 3, and $\phi : \mathbf{R}^3 \to \mathbf{R}$ is a continuously bounded function.

We said that projective synchronization (PS), full-state hybrid projective synchronization (FSHPS) and generalized synchronization (GS) co-exist in the synchronization of the systems (1) and (2), if there exist controllers u_i , $1 \le i \le 3$, such that the synchronization nization errors (3) satisfy

$$\lim_{k \to +\infty} e_i(k) = 0, \quad i = 1, 2, 3.$$
(4)

3 Synchronization Approach

As the drive system, we consider the following hyperchaotic map

$$x_i(k+1) = f_i(X(k)), \quad 1 \le i \le 3,$$
(5)

where $X(k) = (x_1(k), x_2(k), x_3(k))^T$ is the state vector of the drive system, $f_i : \mathbf{R}^3 \longrightarrow \mathbf{R}, 1 \le i \le 3$. As the response, we consider the following chaotic system

$$y_i(k+1) = \sum_{j=1}^3 b_{ij} y_j(k) + g_i(Y(k)) + u_i, \quad 1 \le i \le 3,$$
(6)

where $Y(k) = (y_1(k), y_2(k), y_3(k))^T$ is the state vector of the response systems, $(b_{ij}) \in \mathbf{R}^{3\times3}$ is the linear part of the response system, $g_i : \mathbf{R}^3 \longrightarrow \mathbf{R}, 1 \le i \le 3$, are nonlinear functions and $u_i, 1 \le i \le 3$, are controllers to be designed.

The error system, according to (3), between the drive system (5) and the response system (6) can be derived as

$$e_{1}(k+1) = y_{1}(k+1) - \theta x_{1}(k+1),$$

$$e_{2}(k+1) = y_{2}(k+1) - \sum_{j=1}^{3} \lambda_{j} x_{j} (k+1),$$

$$e_{3}(k+1) = y_{3}(k+1) - \phi (X (k+1)).$$
(7)

Then, the error system (7) can be written as

$$e_{1}(k+1) = \sum_{j=1}^{3} b_{1j}y_{j}(k) + g_{1}(Y(k)) + u_{1} - \theta f_{1}(X(k)), \qquad (8)$$

$$e_{2}(k+1) = \sum_{j=1}^{3} b_{2j}y_{j}(k) + g_{2}(Y(k)) + u_{2} - \sum_{j=1}^{3} \lambda_{j}f_{j}(X(k)), \qquad (8)$$

$$e_{3}(k+1) = \sum_{j=1}^{3} b_{3j}y_{j}(k) + g_{3}(Y(k)) + u_{2} - \phi (f_{1}(X(k)), f_{2}(X(k)), f_{3}(X(k))).$$

To achieve synchronization between the drive system (5) and the response system

(6), we propose the following synchronization controllers

$$u_{1} = N_{1} - b_{11}\theta x_{1}(k) - b_{12}\left(\sum_{j=1}^{3}\lambda_{j}x_{j}(k)\right) - \sum_{j=1}^{3}l_{1j}e_{j}(k), \qquad (9)$$

$$u_{2} = N_{2} - b_{21}\theta x_{1}(k) - b_{22} \left(\sum_{j=1}^{3} \lambda_{j} x_{j}(k)\right) - \sum_{j=1}^{3} l_{2j}e_{j}(k),$$

$$u_{3} = N_{3} - b_{31}\theta x_{1}(k) - b_{32} \left(\sum_{j=1}^{3} \lambda_{j} x_{j}(k)\right) - \sum_{j=1}^{3} l_{3j}e_{j}(k),$$

where

$$N_{1} = \theta f_{1}(X(k)) - b_{13}\phi(X(k)) - g_{1}(Y(k)), \qquad (10)$$

$$N_{2} = \sum_{j=1}^{3} \lambda_{j} f_{j}(X(k)) - b_{23}\phi(X(k)) - g_{2}(Y(k)), \qquad (10)$$

$$N_{3} = \phi(f_{1}(X(k)), f_{2}(X(k)), f_{3}(X(k))) - b_{33}\phi(X(k)) - g_{3}(Y(k)), \qquad (10)$$

and $(l_{ij}) \in \mathbf{R}^{3 \times 3}$ are control constants to be determined later. By substituting the control law (9) into (8), the error system can be described as

$$e_{1}(k+1) = \sum_{j=1}^{3} (b_{1j} - l_{1j}) e_{j}(k), \qquad (11)$$

$$e_{2}(k+1) = \sum_{j=1}^{3} (b_{2j} - l_{2j}) e_{j}(k),$$

$$e_{3}(k+1) = \sum_{j=1}^{3} (b_{3j} - l_{3j}) e_{j}(k).$$

Now, rewrite the error system described in (11) in the compact form

$$e(k+1) = (B-L)e(k),$$
(12)

where $e(k) = (e_1(k), e_2(k), e_3(k))^T$, $B = (b_{ij})_{3 \times 3}$ and $L = (l_{ij})_{3 \times 3}$. Hence, we have the following result.

Theorem 3.1 If the control matrix L is chosen such that one of the following conditions is satisfied:

(i) All eigenvalues of B - L are strictly inside the unit disk. (ii) $(B-L)^T(B-L) - I$ is negative definite matrix. (iii) $(l_{ij})_{1 \le i, j \le 3}$ are chosen such that 3

$$\sum_{i=1}^{3} (b_{ip} - l_{ip}) (b_{iq} - l_{iq}) = 0, \quad p, q = 1, 2, 3, \quad p \neq q,$$

$$\sum_{i=1}^{3} (b_{ij} - l_{ij})^2 < 1, \quad j = 1, 2, 3.$$
(13)

315

Then, (PS), (FSHPS) and (GS) co-exist between the drive system (5) and the response system (6).

Proof. Firstly, according to stability theory of linear discrete-time systems, we can conclude that if condition (i) is satisfied it is immediate that $\lim_{k \to +\infty} e_i(k) = 0, i = 1, 2, 3$. Therefore, systems (5) and (6) are globally synchronized.

Secondly, we construct the Lyapunov function in the form $V(e(k)) = e^{T}(k)e(k)$, we obtain

$$\Delta V(e(k)) = e^{T}(k+1)e(k+1) - e^{T}(k)e(k)$$

= $e^{T}(k)(B-L)^{T}(B-L)e(k) - e^{T}(k)e(k)$
= $e^{T}(k)\left[(B-L)^{T}(B-L) - I\right]e(k),$

and by using condition (ii) we get $\Delta V(e(k)) < 0$. Thus, from the Lyapunov stability theory, it is immediate that $\lim_{k \to +\infty} e_i(k) = 0$ (i = 1, 2, 3) then the synchronization is achieved between systems (5) and (6).

Finally, consider the candidate Lyapunov function: $V(e(k)) = \sum_{i=1}^{3} e_i^2(k)$, we get

$$\Delta V(e(k)) = \sum_{i=1}^{3} e_i^2 (k+1) - \sum_{i=1}^{3} e_i^2 (k)$$

=
$$\sum_{j=1}^{3} \left(\sum_{i=1}^{3} (b_{ij} - l_{ij})^2 - 1 \right) e_j^2(k)$$

+
$$\sum_{\substack{p, q=1\\p \neq q}}^{3} \left(\sum_{i=1}^{3} (b_{ip} - l_{ip}) (b_{iq} - l_{iq}) \right) e_p(k) e_q(k).$$

and by using conditions (iii), we obtain $\Delta V(e(k)) < 0$. Then, it is immediate that $\lim_{k \to +\infty} e_i(k) = 0$ (i = 1, 2, 3), and we conclude that the systems (4) and (5) are globally synchronized.

4 Numerical Example

We consider hyperchaotic Stefanski map as the drive system and the controlled hyperchaotic Wang map as the response system. The drive system is described as

$$\begin{aligned} x_1(k+1) &= 1 + x_3(k) - \alpha x_2^2(k), \\ x_2(k+1) &= 1 + \beta x_2(k) - \alpha x_1^2(k), \\ x_3(k+1) &= \beta x_1(k), \end{aligned}$$
(14)

which has a chaotic attractor, when $(\alpha, \beta) = (1.4, 0.2)$ [36]. The hyperchaotic attractor of Stefanski map is shown in Figure 1. The response system can be defined as

$$y_{1}(k+1) = a_{3}\delta y_{2}(k) + (a_{4}\delta + 1) y_{1}(k) + u_{1},$$

$$y_{2}(k+1) = a_{1}\delta y_{1}(k) + y_{2}(k) + a_{2}\delta y_{3}(k) + u_{2},$$

$$y_{3}(k+1) = (a_{7}\delta + 1) y_{3}(k) + a_{6}\delta y_{2}(k) y_{3}(k) + a_{5}\delta + u_{3},$$
(15)

316



Figure 1: Hyperchaotic attractor of Stefanski map.

where $U = (u_1, u_2, u_3)^T$ is the vector controller. The hyperchaotic Wang map has a chaotic attractor, when $(a_1, a_2, a_3, a_4, a_5, a_6, a_7, \delta) = (-1.9, 0.2, 0.5, -2.3, 2, -0.6, -1.9, 1)$ [35]. The hyperchaotic attractor of Wang map is shown in Figure 2. According to our control scheme proposed in the previous section



Figure 2: Hyperchaotic attractor of Wang map.

the synchronization errors between the drive system (14) and the response system (15)

are defined as follows

$$e_{1}(k+1) = y_{1}(k+1) - \theta x_{1}(k+1), \qquad (16)$$

$$e_{2}(k+1) = y_{2}(k+1) - \sum_{j=1}^{3} \lambda_{j} x_{j}(k+1), \qquad (16)$$

$$e_{3}(k+1) = y_{3}(k+1) - \phi (x_{1}(k+1), x_{2}(k+1), x_{3}(k+1)).$$

In this example, the scaling constants θ , λ_1 , λ_2 and λ_3 are chosen as

$$\begin{cases}
\theta = 2, \\
\lambda_1 = 1, \\
\lambda_2 = 2, \\
\lambda_3 = 3,
\end{cases}$$
(17)

and the map $\phi : \mathbf{R}^3 \to \mathbf{R}$ is selected as

$$\phi(x_1(k), x_2(k), x_3(k)) = x_1(k) - x_2(k)x_3(k).$$
(18)

Then, the errors system (16) can be described as

$$e_{1}(k+1) = (a_{4}\delta + 1) e_{1}(k) + R_{1} + u_{1}, \qquad (19)$$

$$e_{2}(k+1) = e_{2}(k) + R_{2} + u_{2},$$

$$e_{3}(k+1) = (a_{7}\delta + 1) e_{3}(k) + u_{3},$$

where

$$R_{1} = a_{3}\delta y_{2}(k) + \sum_{j=1}^{3} \mu_{1j}x_{j}(k) + 2\alpha x_{2}^{2}(k) - 2, \qquad (20)$$

$$R_{2} = a_{1}\delta y_{1}(k) + a_{2}\delta y_{3}(k) + \sum_{j=1}^{3} \mu_{2j}x_{j}(k) + \alpha x_{2}^{2}(k) + 2\alpha x_{1}^{2}(k) - 3, \qquad (30)$$

$$R_{3} = a_{6}\delta y_{2}(k)y_{3}(k) + \sum_{j=1}^{3} \mu_{3j}x_{j}(k) - (a_{7}\delta + 1)x_{2}(k)x_{3}(k) + \beta x_{1}(k)x_{2}(k)$$

$$\alpha\beta x_1^3(k) + \alpha x_2^2(k) + a_5\delta - 1,$$

where $\mu_{11} = 2(a_4\delta + 1)$, $\mu_{12} = 0$, $\mu_{13} = -2$, $\mu_{21} = -3\beta + 1$, $\mu_{22} = 2(1 - \beta)$, $\mu_{23} = 2$, $\mu_{31} = a_7\delta + 1 - \beta$, $\mu_{31} = a_7\delta + 1 + \beta$, $\mu_{32} = 0$, and $\mu_{33} = -1$.

To achieve synchronization between systems (14) and (15), we choose the synchronization controllers u_i (i = 1, 2, 3), as

$$u_i = -R_i - l_i e_i, \quad i = 1, 2, 3, \tag{21}$$

where the control constants $(l_i)_{1 \le i \le 3}$ are selected as follows

$$l_1 = a_4 \delta,$$
 (22)
 $|l_2| < 1,$
 $l_3 = a_7 \delta.$

318

Theorem 4.1 The hyperchaotic Stefanski map (14) and the controlled hyperchaotic Wang map (15) are globally synchronized under the controllers (21).

Proof. By substituting (21) into (19), the synchronization errors can be written as

$$e_{1}(k+1) = e_{1}(k), \qquad (23)$$

$$e_{2}(k+1) = (1-l_{2})e_{2}(k), \qquad (23)$$

$$e_{3}(k+1) = e_{3}(k).$$

To prove the zero-stability of synchronization errors (23), we consider the quadratic Lyapunov function $V(e(k)) = \sum_{i=1}^{3} e_i^2(k)$, then we obtain

$$\Delta V(e(k)) = \sum_{i=1}^{3} e_i^2 (k+1) - \sum_{i=1}^{3} e_i^2 (k)$$

= $e_1^2 (k) + (1-l_2)^2 e_2^2 (k) + e_3^2 (k) - e_1^2 (k) - e_2^2 (k) - e_3^2 (k)$
= $(1-l_2)^2 e_2^2 (k) < 0.$

Thus, by Lyapunov stability it is immediate that $\lim_{k\to\infty} e_i(k) = 0$ (i = 1, 2, 3). Finally, we get the numeric results that are shown in Figure 3.



Figure 3: Time evolution of errors between systems (14) and (15).

5 Conclusion

In this paper, the co-existence of some synchronization types in general 3D coupled hyperchaotic maps has been investigated. Sufficient conditions have been derived for

achieving a new synchronization scheme of co-existence of (PS), (FSHPS) and (GS) between hyperchaotic maps. The new synchronization criterion has been demonstrated using nonlinear controllers, stability theory of linear discrete-time systems and Lyapunov stability theory. An example of application and numerical simulations have been used to show the effectiveness of the derived result.

References

- [1] Rössler, O.E. An equation for hyperchaos. *Physics Letters A* 8 (2008) 35–42.
- [2] Matsumoto, T., Chua, L.O. and Kobayashi, K. Hyperchaos: laboratory experiment and numerical confirmation. *IEEE Transactions on Circuits and Systems* **33** (11) (1986) 1143– 1147.
- [3] Stoop, R. and Meier, P.F. Evaluation of Lyapunov exponents and scaling functions from time series. *Journal of the Optical Society of America B* **5** (5) (1988) 1037–1045.
- [4] Stoop, R., Peinke, J., Parisi, J., Röhricht, B. and Hübener, R.P. A p-Ge semiconductor experiment showing chaos and hyperchaos. *Physica D* 35 (1989) 425–435.
- [5] Eiswirth, M., Kruel, Th.-M., Ertl, G. and Schneider, F. W. Hyperchaos in a chemical reaction. *Chemical Physics Letters* 193 (4) (1992) 305–310.
- Baier, G. and Klein, M. Maximum hyperchaos in generalized Hénon maps. *Physics Letters* A 51 (1990) 281–284.
- [7] Hitzl, D.L. and Zele, F. An exploration of the Hénon quadratic map. *Physica D* 14 (3) (1985) 305–326.
- [8] Stefanski, K. Modelling chaos and hyperchaos with 3D maps. Chaos, Solitons and Fractals 9 (1-2) (1998) 83–93.
- [9] Wang, X.Y. Chaos in Complex Nonlinear Systems. Publishing House of Electronics Industry. Beijing, 2003.
- [10] Itoh, M., Yang, T. and Chua, L.O. Conditions for impulsive synchronization of chaotic and hyperchaotic systems. *International Journal of Bifurcation and Chaos* 11 (2001) 551–560.
- [11] Grassi, G. and Miller, D. A. Dead-beat full state hybrid projective synchronization for chaotic maps using a scalar synchronizing signal. *Chinese Physics B* 17 (4) (2012) 1824– 1830.
- [12] Aguilar Bustos, A.Y., Cruz Hernández, C., López Gutiérrez, R.M. and Posadas Castillo, Y.C. Synchronization of different hyperchaotic maps for encryption. *Nonlinear Dynamics* and Systems Theory 8 (3) (2008) 221–236.
- [13] Aguilar Bustos, A.Y. and Cruz Hernández, C. Synchronization of discrete-time hyperchaotic systems: An application in communications. *Chaos, Solitons and Fractals* **41** (3) (2009) 1301–1310.
- [14] Cruz Hernández, C., Lopez Gutierrez, R. M., Aguilar Bustos, A. Y. and Posadas Castillo, Y.C. Communicating encrypted information based on synchronized hyperchaotic maps. *Communications in Nonlinear Sciences and Numerical Simulation* 11 (5) (2010) 337–349.
- [15] Liu, W., Wang, Z.M. and Zhang, W.D. Controlled synchronization of discrete-time chaotic systems under communication constraints. *Nonlinear Dynamics* 69 (2012) 223–230.
- [16] Inzunza González, E.Y. and Cruz Hernandez, C. Double hyperchaotic encryption for security in biometric systems. Nonlinear Dynamics and Systems Theory 13 (1) (2013) 55–68.
- [17] Filali, R.L., Benrejeb, M. and Borne, P. On observer-based secure communication design using discrete-time hyperchaotic systems. *Communications in Nonlinear Science and Numerical Simulation* 19 (5) 2014 1424–1432.

- [18] Ouannas, A. A synchronization criterion for a class of sinusoidal chaotic maps via linear controller. International Journal of Contemporary Mathematical Sciences 9 (14) (2014) 677–683.
- [19] Ouannas, A. Nonlinear control method of chaos synchronization for arbitrary 2D quadratic dynamical systems in discrete-time. *International Journal of Mathematical Analysis* 8 (53) (2014) 2611–2617.
- [20] Ouannas, A. A new chaos synchronization criterion for discrete dynamical systems. Applied Mathematical Sciences 8 (41) (2014) 2025–2034.
- [21] Ouannas, A. Chaos synchronization approach for coupled of arbitrary 3-D quadratic dynamical systems in discrete-time. Far East Journal of Applied Mathematics 86 (3) (2014) 225–232.
- [22] Ouannas, A. Some synchronization criteria for N-dimensional chaotic dynamical systems in discrete-time. Journal of Advanced Research in Applied Mathematics 6 (4) (2014) 1-9.
- [23] Jin Y., L. Xin, Chen, Y. Function projective synchronization of discrete-time chaotic and hyperchaotic systems using backstepping method. *Communications in Theoritical Physics* 50 (2008) 111–116.
- [24] Li, Y., Chen, Y., and Li, B. Adaptive control and function projective synchronization in 2D discrete-time chaotic systems. *Communications in Theoritical Physics* 51 (2009) 270–278.
- [25] Li, Y., Chen, Y., and Li, B. Adaptive function projective synchronization of discrete-time chaotic systems. *Chinese Physics Lettres* 26 (4) (2009) 040504–4.
- [26] Hong-Li An, Yong Chen. The function cascade synchronization scheme for discrete-time hyperchaotic systems. *Communications in Nonlinear Science and Numerical Simulation* 14 (2009) 1494–1501.
- [27] Ma, Z., Liu, Z. and Zhang, G. Generalized synchronization of discrete systems. Applied Mathematics and Mechanics 28 5 (2007) 609–614.
- [28] Grassi, G. Generalized synchronization between different chaotic maps via dead-beat control. *Chinese Physics B* **21** (5) (2012) 050505.
- [29] Chai, Y., Lü, L., and Zhao, H.Y. Lag synchronization between discrete chaotic systems with diverse structure. Applied Mathematics and Mechanics 31 (6) (2010) 733–738.
- [30] Yanbo, G., Xiaomei, Z., Guoping, L. and Yufan, Z. Impulsive synchronization of discretetime chaotic systems under communication constraints. *Communications in Nonlinear Sci*ence and Numerical Simulation 16 (2011) 1580–1588.
- [31] Filali, R.L., Hammami, S., Benrejeb, M. and Borne, P. On synchronization, antisynchronization and hybrid synchronization of 3D discrete generalized Hénon map. Nonlinear Dynamics and Systems Theory 12 (1) (2012) 81–95.
- [32] Ouannas, A. A new Q-S synchronization scheme for discrete chaotic systems. Far East Journal of Applied Mathematics 84 (2) (2013) 89–94.
- [33] Grassi, G. Arbitrary full-state hybrid projective synchronization for chaotic discrete-time systems via a scalar signal. *Chinese Physics B* **21** (2012) 060504–5.
- [34] Ouannas, A. On full-state hybrid projective synchronization of general discrete chaotic systems. Journal of Nonlinear Dynamics 2014 1–6.
- [35] Yan, Z.Y. Q-S (complete or anticipated) synchronization backstepping scheme in a class of discrete-time chaotic (hyperchaotic) systems: A symbolic-numeric computation approach. *Chaos* 16 (2006) 013119–11.
- [36] Yan, Z.Y. Q-S synchronization in 3D Hénon-like map and generalized Hénon map via a scalar controller. *Physics Letters A* 342 (2005) 309–317.